



# PLUMMER

August 23, 2024

Mr. Jeff Price  
Executive Director of Public Works  
City of Mansfield  
1200 E. Broad Street  
Mansfield, Texas 76063

Re: City of Mansfield  
Bud Ervin Water Treatment Plant – Phase V Expansion  
Proposal Package 1 – Membrane Equipment  
Recommendation of Award

Dear Mr. Price:

On Friday, August 2, 2024, two proposals from membrane system suppliers were received, opened, and read aloud on a public virtual call (including Archer Western Contractors, Plummer, and the City of Mansfield staff) for the above-referenced proposal package. The cost and capacity portion of the proposals were as follows:

Bid Item	Aria Filtra		H2O Innovation/Nanostone	
	Capacity (MGD)	Amount Bid	Capacity (MGD)	Amount Bid
A.1 – Four (4) New Racks	13.36	\$3,640,000	16.00	\$6,698,545
A.2 – 30 MGD Expansion	30.07	\$5,560,000	34.00	\$11,168,415
A.3 – Buildout Expansion	33.41	\$6,470,000	41.20	\$13,746,880

This equipment package was advertised as an evaluated proposal package (including cost and non-cost evaluation criteria) by the City’s Construction Manager At Risk (CMAR), Archer Western. The project team met on August 14, 2024, to evaluate the proposals.

Plummer has reviewed both proposals and finds both to be complete. Plummer evaluated the proposals and developed a thorough cost and non-cost evaluation of each proposal that was presented to the City, which included considerations for capital costs, anticipated O&M costs, module and system performance, warranty terms, and aftermarket support offerings based on information provided in the proposals and information collected through coordination with the suppliers prior to the equipment bid. The final scoring for the proposal evaluation prepared by the City is presented below:

Parameter	Points Possible	A.1 - 4 New Racks		A.2 - 30 MGD Expansion		A.3 - Buildout Expansion	
		Aria Filtra	H2O/Nanostone	Aria Filtra	H2O/Nanostone	Aria Filtra	H2O/Nanostone
<b>Cost Scoring</b>	<b>600</b>	--	--	--	--	--	--
Cost of Work per million gallons (70%)	420	407	386	387	362	420	400
LCC per million gallons (30%)	180	180	173	151	147	163	164
<b>Non-Cost Scoring</b>	<b>400</b>	298	250	318	293	344	339
<b>Total Score</b>	<b>1000</b>	<b>885</b>	<b>809</b>	<b>856</b>	<b>802</b>	<b>927</b>	<b>904</b>

The City's scoring shows that Aria Filtra's Bid Item A.3 has the highest total score. Plummer completed a separate scoring evaluation, and Plummer's final scoring also shows Aria Filtra's Bid Item A.3 offering as the highest scoring option. According to the final scoring, Aria Filtra's buildout expansion offers the best value to the City of the expansion options proposed by both vendors as it relates to the capital and O&M costs and membrane system capacity associated with each. Therefore, Plummer recommends awarding **Aria Filtra's Bid Item A.3** and authorizing Archer Western to enter into a contract with Aria Filtra on the City's behalf for the amount of the Total Base Bid of \$6,470,000.00.

Please call me if you have any questions. We look forward to continuing working with you and Archer Western on this exciting project for the City.

Sincerely,

PLUMMER ASSOCIATES, INC.



Marshall Plunk, P.E.