



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #:	22-4711	Version:	1	Name:	HLC#22-005: Public hearing to consider a request for exterior changes to the Dennis Mahoney Building, 1890, at 115 N. Main Street by Nationwide Construction, applicant and BCB Transport Holdings Co., owner
Type:	HLC Case	Status:			Passed
File created:	6/1/2022	In control:			Historic Landmark Commission
On agenda:	6/9/2022	Final action:			6/9/2022
Title:	HLC#22-005: Public hearing to consider a request for exterior changes to the Dennis Mahoney Building, 1890, at 115 N. Main Street by Nationwide Construction, applicant and BCB Transport Holdings Co., owner				

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. Maps and Supporting Information.pdf, 2. Floor Plan and Building Details.pdf, 3. Option 1.pdf, 4. Option 2.pdf, 5. Current Photographs.pdf, 6. Historic Photographs.pdf

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
6/9/2022	1	Historic Landmark Commission	Approved	Pass

HLC#22-005: Public hearing to consider a request for exterior changes to the Dennis Mahoney Building, 1890, at 115 N. Main Street by Nationwide Construction, applicant and BCB Transport Holdings Co., owner

The new owner of the Dennis Mahoney Building proposes a major rehabilitation of the storefront and upper wall on the front façade and renovations on the rear façade. The building is being renovated to accommodate offices for BCB Transport and a studio for the BCB Live podcasts.

The owner is seeking approval of two options for the scope of work. Option 1 involves the removal of the stucco from the upper wall on the front façade to reveal the historic brick. This option will be pursued if the historic brick is still intact and the stucco can be removed without damage to it. Stucco will remain on the piers that frame the storefront.

Option 2 involves the repair of the stucco if the stucco cannot be removed without damage to the historic brick. Plans for both options have been provided for the Commission's review

Architectural Review

Unusually for a commercial building of the 1890s, the Mahoney storefront did not appear to use ornamental cast iron columns on the front façade, although there are extant cast iron thresholds with D. Mahoney molded into it. From photographic evidence, the building had either simple cast iron columns or wood columns to frame the storefront.

The proposed rehabilitation reflects the appearance of the Mansfield Hardware Supply storefront from the late 1940s and the 1950's. Some of the features from the original storefront were carried over as seen in photographs from 1901 and 1905, such as the transom windows and the square

window arrangement around the doors. The 1928 photograph shows the upper brick wall prior to the application of stucco.

The rear façade is a later addition to the Mahoney building. The addition originally had wood frame construction and was built prior to 1921. The addition was reconstructed in brick sometime between 1921 and 1933. The brick addition was later covered in stucco. Openings in the wall may have been blocked with cement blocks. The existing rear façade exhibits three building materials: brick, cement blocks and stucco. The applicant proposes to patch the stucco, which the predominant wall material.

The work is described in the sections below with the applicable standards from the *Design Guidelines for Downtown Mansfield*. The Commission must consider the standards when reviewing changes or alterations to landmark buildings.

Storefront

The following modifications are proposed for the storefront for both options:

- Replacement of the existing storefront with a new storefront that reflects the character of the building's historic storefront.
- New awning on the front façade.
- New display windows with bulkheads and windows around the doors.
- New wood entry doors.

Storefront Guidelines:

1. *Maintain the proportion, dimension, and traditional elements of the storefront.*

The proposed storefront was based on photographs of the historic building and designed to maintain the storefront proportions.

2. *Design the storefront to fit inside the original opening and not extend beyond it.*

The storefront fits within the area of the existing modern storefront.

3. *Design the storefront to be transparent. Large windows should be incorporated to provide maximum light and display.*

The storefront provides large display windows on either side of the entry doors.

4. *Preserve or restore the original design features of the storefront. The basic storefront design should consist of large display windows, transoms, bulkheads at the base of the display windows, and a cornice or a horizontal sign panel at the top of the storefront.*

The storefront is designed to incorporate these elements based on historical photographs of the building.

5. *The features may be constructed of either traditional or compatible contemporary painted materials.*

The storefront uses wood for the columns and window frames. The new awning will be metal.

6. *Do not use wood siding, imitation brick or stone, or gravel aggregate materials on a commercial storefront downtown.*

The storefront uses simulated wood siding panels with wood moulding for the bulkheads under the display windows. As the original storefront materials have been removed and the bulkheads represent a small proportion of the overall façade, the use of siding may be considered.

Entrance and Door Guidelines:

7. *Maintain the original size, shape, and character of the storefront entrance and door. Restoration work should be based on documentary evidence on historic buildings downtown.*

The design of the storefront is based on historical photographs. The entrance and doors reflect the character of the historic storefront.

8. *Install doors made of wood if possible.*

There are two wood doors proposed with brass kickplates on the storefront.

9. *Assure all wood storefront doors have large glass panels to maintain the transparency of the storefront.*

The doors have large plate windows that meet this requirement.

Bulkhead Standards:

10. *Maintain or restore bulkheads at the base of display windows to protect the windows and define entrances.*

The proposed bulkheads under the storefront windows are based on historical photographs and include similar moulding to those in the photographs.

11. *Use a new simple design that reflects the traditional character of typical bulkheads if information on the original design is not available from historic photographs. Bulkheads can be constructed of wood, stone, glass, tile, or painted metal.*

The original design is reflected in the new bulkheads. The bulkheads are simulated wood siding with wood moulding.

Transom Guidelines:

12. *Preserve or re-establish the original size and shape of the glass transoms above display windows.*

If the existing transom windows are salvageable, they will be cleaned, repaired, weather-proofed and repainted. If the windows cannot be salvaged, they will be replaced with windows with the same design.

13. *Construct transoms using traditional materials. Transom windows can be made of clear, tinted*

or stained glass. Opaque materials are inappropriate.

The transom windows have wood frames.

Awning Guidelines:

14. *Emphasize divisions between buildings and strong vertical elements of the façade with awnings.*

The proposed awning will extend across the façade over the display windows similar to the original awning placement.

15. *Awnings should not obscure or cut across strong vertical elements such as the cast iron columns common to most buildings downtown. Awnings should fit between them rather than cover them.*

The awning will be placed between the top of the display windows and the transom windows as shown in the Mansfield Hardware Supply photograph. The storefront plan will split the columns above and below the awning as shown on the elevations.

16. *Design the awnings to conform to the shape of the opening. Do not try to fit a rectangular awning into an arched window or vice versa. Fit awnings within their openings.*

The rectangular awning is parallel to the plane of the display and transom windows.

17. *Awnings may be erected either above transoms and below the cornice, or between the transom and the display windows. It is also appropriate to erect awnings above entrances.*

The awning is located between the transom and display windows.

18. *Design awnings and canopies to complement the scale of the building. They should not cover more than one third of the opening. If they are too large, they obscure architectural details, and block the pedestrian view of the inside of the building. If they are too small, the benefit they provide is insignificant.*

The awning is in scale with the storefront and does not obscure architectural details.

19. *Use appropriate materials for awning construction. Fabric awnings are encouraged. Awnings were traditionally constructed of heavy canvas; however synthetic opaque fabrics with a matte finish are also appropriate material. Wood, shingles, shiny vinyls, and plastics are inappropriate construction materials.*

The awning will be constructed of metal. Metal is a material shown on the historic awnings on buildings in Downtown Mansfield according to historical photographs.

20. *Do not use residential type awnings for commercial buildings.*

The awning is not a residential type awning.

21. *Relate the color of awning to the building paint scheme or the color of the materials used to*

construct the building, and to other decorative trims.

The awning is shown on the color renderings with a color compatible with the storefront.

22. *Align awnings with others on the block to maintain the visual continuity of the block.*

The awning close in plane with the buildings on either side of the Mahoney Building.

23. *Assure any awning design conforms to local fire and building codes.*

The awning will be part of the building permit application for the renovations.

24. *Do not illuminate awnings and canopies. Brightly lit awnings at night overemphasize the storefront at the expense of the rest of the building facade and detract from the appearance of adjacent buildings.*

No lighting is shown on the awning in the plans.

Building Improvements

The following modifications are proposed for the building:

- If possible, remove the stucco from the upper wall on the front façade.
- Repair and repoint existing brick.
- Patch and repair the roof as needed.
- Remodel the rear façade by removing the existing doors and adding new doors and windows.
- Patch the stucco on the rear wall.
- Add new awnings over the doors and windows on the rear façade.

Masonry Guidelines:

1. *Remove any covering which obscures the original masonry exterior from view provided the removal process can be accomplished without damage to the masonry.*

The applicant proposes to remove the stucco on the upper wall of the front façade if it can be done without damage to the historic materials as shown on the Option 1 plan. Note that only the stucco on the upper wall will be removed. The stucco covering the piers that frame the storefront will remain.

2. *Do not remove firmly adhering stucco from masonry surfaces.*

If the historic brick will be damaged by the removal of the stucco, the existing stucco will be repairs as shown on the Option 2 plan.

3. *Remove weakened or deteriorated stucco from original masonry using hand tools to avoid*

damaging the masonry.

Techniques to remove stucco have changed over the years since this standard was adopted. Removal of stucco using the gentlest modern preservation methods may be appropriate. The process of removing the stucco should be determined by a qualified historic masonry professional.

4. *Clean masonry only when necessary to stop deterioration or remove heavy soiling.*

Should the exposed masonry need cleaning, the method should be determined by a qualified historic masonry professional.

5. *Repoint mortar joints where deterioration is evident.*

Option 1 proposes the repair and repointing of the existing brick.

6. *Remove deteriorated mortar by hand-raking the joints to avoid damaging the masonry.*

Techniques regarding mortar have changed over the years since this standard was adopted. The method removing old mortar should be determined by a qualified historic masonry professional.

7. *Duplicate old mortar in strength, composition, color, and texture.*

The Option 1 plan notes that the mortar will repointed with historically accurate mortar. The mortar color should be similar to that of the historic mortar remaining on the building as determined by a qualified historic masonry professional.

8. *Duplicate old mortar joints in width and joint profile.*

The shape of the exterior edge (joint profile) and thickness of the mortar between the layers of brick should match the historic mortar on the building as determined by a qualified historic masonry professional.

9. *Replace extensively deteriorated or missing historic brick with new brick which duplicates the historic brick in strength, composition, color, and texture.*

The condition of the masonry cannot be evaluated until the stucco has been removed from the upper wall. Once the stucco is removed, the masonry should be inspected by a qualified historic masonry professional to develop a plan for the retention or replacement of the historic brick.

10. *Never remove damaged or deteriorated masonry which could reasonably be repaired and preserved.*

The condition of the masonry cannot be evaluated until the stucco has been removed from the upper wall. Once the stucco is removed, the masonry should be inspected by a qualified historic masonry professional to develop a plan for the retention or replacement of the historic brick.

Rear Entrance:

Although the *Design Guidelines* do not explicitly address rear facades, the following policies were

reviewed and preliminarily accepted by the Commission as part of the design guideline update currently in progress:

11. The rear entrance on a historic building was typically a service entrance for employees and deliveries. In more recent times, many rear entrances have come to serve as a second customer entrance or to provide access to parking or a patio/outdoor seating area. The rear façade tends to have fewer character-defining features than other street-facing facades, allowing opportunities for improvement. Enhancing the rear entrance as an incidental public face of the building is encouraged. A compatible paint scheme, new doors, windows and canopies or awnings can be added to the rear without affecting the overall character of the building.

12. *Design improvements for the rear entrance to be recognizable as a recent change. The improvements should not compete with the main entrance.*

Modern doors and windows are being added to the rear façade. The proposed modern-style windows can be identified as a later improvement. The arrangement of the rear façade does not compete with the main storefront.

13. *Add planters, lighting, canopies and/or awnings to the rear entry.*

Awnings will be added above the doors and windows on the rear façade.

Paint

The applicant proposes the paint colors listed below, depending on which option the project takes.

Option 1 colors:

Light color - Sherwin Williams SW 2829 Classic White

Blue Band - Sherwin Williams SW 2819 Downing Slate

Dark Stucco Accent - Sherwin Williams SW 2837 Aurora Brown

Red Stucco - Sherwin Williams SW 2804 Renwick Rose Beige

Painted Wood - Sherwin Williams SW 2836 Quartersawn Oak

Option 2 colors:

Light color - Sherwin Williams SW 2829 Classic White

Blue Band - Sherwin Williams SW 2819 Downing Slate

Dark Stucco Accent - Sherwin Williams SW 2837 Aurora Brown

Brown Stucco - Sherwin Williams SW 2835 Craftsman Brown

Painted Wood - Sherwin Williams SW 2836 Quartersawn Oak

Color Guidelines:

1. *Choose paint colors based on the building's historical appearance. Selection of paint and stain colors based on research of historic colors and finishes is encouraged.*

2. *Body and trim colors should not be similar in hue or tone intensity (i.e. 2 shades of colors that are closely related like green and red or 2 dark or light shades of the same color). Paint colors should be complementary to each other and the overall character of the historic building and should be used to accentuate the building's significant features.*

3. *A third color, commonly called an accent color, was quite often utilized to accentuate or*

highlight a particular feature of a house or building. Doors, window sashes, or special or decorative trim was typically painted an accent color.

4. *The articulation and details of exterior walls, window and doors and openings, trim, scale and texture of exterior materials can be enhanced or obscured by appropriate and inappropriate paint colors selected for a building.*
5. *Paint replacement gutters, downspouts, metal frame screen and storm doors and windows, roof-vent assemblies and fire escapes to match the color of the wall, trim, cornice or roof color, whichever is the most effective in reducing the visibility of these elements.*

For the storefront, the applicant selected colors from the Sherwin Williams palette using Victorian, Classical and Arts & Crafts era paints. These paints categories are appropriate to the building.

Victorian Colors (1865 - 1915):

- Downing Slate
- Renwick Rose Beige
- Quartersawn Oak

Classical (1800 -):

- Classical White

Arts & Crafts (1890 - 1940):

- Aurora Brown
- Craftsman Brown

It is not possible to determine the original colors of the storefront, historic photographs show lighter and darker shades were used. The proposed color schemes highlight the storefront, with lighter colors for the columns and beam and shades of brown for the display and transom window frames, doors, and bulkheads. For Option 1, the paint on the stucco will complement the exposed brick. For Option 2, the stucco will be painted brown. The architectural insets in the piers will be highlighted with a darker color. Downing Slate blue will be used to accent the wood moulding on the bulkheads.

The rear façade is currently painted with a blue color close to Downing Slate. As it is an existing color, the applicant may continue to use the same color on the rear façade or use a color from the storefront palette.

Signs

The applicant has not yet developed a sign plan for the building.

This is a large project with various permitting requirements. To reduce permitting time, Staff requests that the Commission considers authorizing the Historic Preservation Officer to approve signage for the building if it complies with the design guidelines. If the signage does not comply with the guidelines or if there is a question about the applicability of a standard, the sign application would be referred to the Commission for approval.

Signs Guidelines:

- *Flush mounted signs are encouraged.*
- *Relate all signs to the pedestrian. Large signs are designed to catch the attention of passing motorists and are inappropriate in the downtown area. Smaller signs placed in areas seen easily by pedestrians are more appropriate.*
- *Assure sign location does not obscure the design features of the building. The design of the building facade displays a natural and logical location for the placement of signs. Examine the facade to find that location.*
- *Position flush mounted signs within strong vertical features of the storefront. Such signs should occupy no more than 75% of the sign board.*
- *Design signs to communicate a direct, simple message with as few words as possible.*
- *Choose a letter style that is easy to read and that reflects the image of the business it represents.*
- *Letters should not be too large - 8 to 18 inches in most cases.*
- *Design signs with a dark background and light-colored lettering to achieve maximum visibility.*
- *Sign colors should complement the colors of the building.*

Historic Background

The building was constructed by Dennis Mahoney in 1890. There are no records indicating it being occupied by Mr. Mahoney or the commercial use until 1895. A newspaper article in the Fort Worth Weekly Gazette, dated October 29, 1890, reported "D. Mahoney of Corpus Christ broke dirt today for a mammoth brick building 55x80." Based on the dates of the other buildings on Main Street, the Mahoney Building is the oldest continually occupied commercial building in Mansfield.

In 1895, the building was occupied by A. J. Dukes and Henderson Poe as a hardware store on one side of the building. Marple Drug Store leased the other half. Mr. Dukes was a private in the Twelfth Missouri cavalry of the Confederate Army. He was wounded and taken prisoner by Union Forces. Upon his release, he moved to Mansfield. Henderson Poe served in the First Texas Mounted Rifles and later the first regiment Texas Cavalry. After the war, he returned to the family farm north of Mansfield.

In 1919, the building was sold to John Henry Harrison, the home of Harrison Hardware. Promissory notes found later indicate that the building may have been used as a lending institute as well as a hardware store.

In the 1920's, leading young citizens gathered at the Blue Goose Confectionary to decide the fate of the community over a bottle of "Sody-Water" and later at Pop's Café. G. L. Walker opened the Pic and Pac Grocery in the 1930's. Carrie Mills had a restaurant in the 1940's. G. C. "Cleo" Wilson Hardware was in the building from about 1946 to 1951. A Mr. Payne operated another hardware store until 1965. From about 1965 to 1999, Western Auto occupied the building. In 1999, Troy and Leslie Dorsey opened Troy Dorsey's World Champion Karate school. The building remained a martial arts

school until the building was purchased by BCB Transport.

The building is a registered Mansfield Historic Landmark.

Staff recommends approval.

Attachments

Maps and Supporting Information

Floor Plan and Building Details

Option 1 and Option 2 Exhibits

Current Photographs of Building

Historic Photographs of Building